

**STAUNTON HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
May 28, 2019
5:30 p.m.
Council Chambers**

PRESENT: **David Brown, Chair
Alexander Avery
Michael Brown**

ABSENT : **Deneen Brannock, Vice Chair
Dennis Blanton
Terry Holmes, Council Liaison**

ALSO PRESENT: **Rodney S. Rhodes, Senior Planner
Linda Nesselrodt, Zoning Technician
Frank Strassler, Historic Staunton Foundation
Suzanne F. Simmons, Clerk of
Council**

The Chair opened the meeting at 5:40 p.m.

MOMENT OF SILENCE

A moment of silence was observed. Mr. Michael Brown then read the preamble of the Historic Preservation Commission.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Mr. Avery moved to approve the minutes of the April 23, 2019 meeting as presented. The motion was seconded and carried at 3-0.

NEW BUSINESS

- a. **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
Lois Christine Morse / Chris Lancaster, Valley Air
214 Church Street
Amend COA to Add Screen for New HVAC Units****

Ms. Morse, 214 Church Street, stated she is proposing to install a HVAC compressor screen with fence and shrubs.

Mr. Michael Brown asked if Ms. Morse planned to match the existing fence. Ms. Morse stated that was the original plan, but the fence is shorter than the HVAC units so they are proposing to landscape that area with shrubs that would be taller than the units. Mr. Brown clarified that there would be no hard screening. Ms. Morse stated that was correct.

HSF Recommendation - HSF recommends the Certificate of Appropriateness be approved.

Mr. Michael Brown moved the Certificate of Appropriateness be approved for the landscaping to screen the view of the HVAC equipment.

The motion was properly seconded and carried at 3-0.

b. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
Brad Lovelace
119 Prospect Street
Renovate Screened Porch, Change Garden Area, New Fence

Brad Lovelace, 119 Prospect Street, stated his proposal is to enclose an open section of the rear porch. The project includes new matching siding, wood windows and entry door. The patio area and new steps will be paved with flagstone. A new wood picket fence will be installed along the patio area due to a decrease in elevation.

Mr. Michael Brown asked if the picket fence would be painted or stained. Mr. Lovelace replied that a colored stain would probably be used.

Mr. Michael Brown asked what progress had been made on the window selection. Mr. Lovelace stated he had not contacted any dealers yet and asked what the procedure was once selected.

Mr. Brown stated the Commission would need to see cut sheets first on the windows before approval could be given.

Mr. Lovelace stated he would also look for historic windows. Mr. Brown stated that would need to be submitted as an amendment to the COA.

HSF Recommendation - HSF recommends the Certificate of Appropriateness be approved.

Enclosing the remaining lower section of the rear porch does not alter significant architectural details. The existing siding appears to be modern, exhibits warping, and rot. The wide exposure relates to modern siding products. The proposed wood siding is a historic pattern.

The proposed windows and door appear in scale and relate to the historic two over two windows found on the majority of the house.

The guidelines state:

1. Retain original or later character-defining porches since this element is often critical to the design integrity of the building.

2. Repair and replace damaged elements of porches by matching the materials, methods of construction, and details of the existing original fabric.

Inappropriate Treatments:

10. Do not enclose porches on primary elevations.

11. Avoid enclosing porches on secondary elevations in a manner that radically changes the historic appearance.

This project is at the rear of the house and the historic open porch elements are missing.

The exterior surface of the window casing and sash should not be clad with metal or vinyl. The owner is working to specify all wood windows. Choose a wood window that may be finished with exterior paint and has true divided lights.

The new entry door should also be finished with exterior paint and have true divided lights.

Fence:

8. Wood picket fences should be painted or stained with an opaque stain to complement the historic character of the building and street.

Paving:

9. *Ensure that any new paving material is compatible with the context of traditional materials found on surrounding sites. Avoid large expanses of bright, lightly colored concrete or darkly colored asphalt.*

Mr. Michael Brown moved the Certificate of Appropriateness be approved for replacing the existing siding due to deterioration with new wood siding as submitted. The new siding and materials will have a painted finish.

The patio and steps will be paved with flagstone and a stained wood picket fence will replace the existing chain-link fence.

Approval for the windows and entry door will be held for further review.

Mr. Brown stated the door should not be aluminum clad.

The motion was properly seconded and carried at 3-0.

**c. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
Brian & Jennifer Moore / Thomas Wright
660 W. Frederick Street
Rebuild Deck**

Jennifer Moore, 660 W. Frederick Street, stated she is proposing to construct a new, larger deck utilizing 2x4 construction.

Mr. Avery asked Ms. Moore if she was planning to stain the deck in any particular color. Ms. Moore stated after 6 months she planned to stain the deck in a light brown color. Mr. Wright, contractor, stated the roof and shutters are also brown.

Mr. Avery asked if there would be any lattice around the under part of the deck. Ms. Moore stated there would not be any lattice and would be left open.

HSF Recommendation: HSF recommends the Certificate of Appropriateness be approved. This is a modern structure and the deck is away from Beverly Street so the sight lines are limited.

However, the new deck should be stained to help it blend with the landscape and appear as a garden feature. It is suggested an earth tone be used such as brown, tan, or dark green. Consider using lattice or trellis panels along the deck and installing landscape plantings including climbing roses or clematis.

Mr. Avery moved the Certificate of Appropriateness be approved with the stipulation that the deck be stained.

The motion was properly seconded and carried at 3-0.

Ms. Moore asked if she would need to post any certain paperwork. Ms. Nesselrodt stated she would be mailing the COA and Ms. Moore would only need to keep that on hand. However, once the building permit was obtained, that would need to be posted on site.

d. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
Brad Domino / Jesse Roach, Woodland Builders, LLC
623 Stuart Street
Rebuild Retaining Wall

Jesse Roach, Woodland Builders, LLC, stated the current retaining wall had been torn down. He is proposing to construct a standard concrete wall with rebar reinforcement and match the parge requirements. Mr. Roach also stated he would add a cap on the wall and score the steps per requirements.

Mr. Michael Brown asked Mr. Roach if he planned on troweling the parging for the steps, wall, and cap. Mr. Roach stated he did.

HSF Recommendation: HSF recommends the Certificate of Appropriateness be approved with design considerations. Commonly used broom finish concrete is not appropriate in the historic districts.

Please utilize careful, deliberate trowel finishes that include edging the steps and the wall cap. Float the aggregate sand to the surface. Texture the steps with scoring patterns rather than a broom finish. Use local yellow sand/crushed gravel (not round pea) in the concrete mix rather than the local grey limestone.

Applicable guidelines:

1. The design of new fences and walls should blend in with the materials and designs found in the historic district and should generally reflect the era and style of the surrounding area. Commonly used materials are brick and stone for walls and wood or metal for fences. Historic cast concrete with screened aggregate finishes also is found in the historic districts and may be appropriate for new walls if the color and finish matches historic examples. Planted hedges are also used to define edges of properties.

Paving:

9. Ensure that any new paving material is compatible with the context of traditional materials found on surrounding sites. Avoid large expanses of bright, lightly colored concrete or darkly colored asphalt.

Mr. Michael Brown moved that the Certificate of Appropriateness be approved for the replacement of the retaining wall and the steps utilizing a deliberate trowel finish that includes edging on the steps and the wall cap. The steps will be textured with scoring patterns rather than a broom finish.

Use local yellow sand/crushed gravel (not round pea) in the concrete mix rather than the local grey limestone.

Mr. Roach asked for clarification regarding the parge coat.

Mr. Strassler stated since he is using the parge coat, it's so the colors and things come out in the final finish whether it's parge or concrete of what is viewable.

Mr. Michael Brown stated whatever mix is used for the parging is the important part since that is the visible part.

Mr. Roach asked for clarification regarding scoring on the steps. Mr. Strassler explained that to him.

The motion was properly seconded and carried at 3-0.

e. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
Mark McConnel, Summit Studio
12 Middlebrook Avenue
Request to Amend COA to Have a Broom Finish
For New Concrete

Mark McConnel, 12 Middlebrook Avenue, stated he is requesting to amend the approved Certificate of Appropriateness so that the new concrete will have a broom finish instead of the troweled finish as previously approved. The applicant has serious concerns that the trowel finish will cause a slippery surface on the stairs that would be unsafe for pedestrian traffic.

Mr. McConnel stated he wanted to offer a clarification in that their concern was for the slippery surface of a troweled finish to walk on. He noted that type of finish is not allowed on City sidewalks for obvious reasons. He stated there are a number of components that were being restored or replaced at the project, including buttresses beside the stairway and walls being repaired. He noted they were only concerned about the non-slip surface on the walking surface. Mr. McConnel stated it would be a good look to smooth finish all of the components that were not walking surfaces. He noted the only part that would be broom finished would be the sidewalk and the tops of the steps.

Mr. Michael Brown stated on inspection, where there are joints, it appeared to be tooled at the joints and around the edges of each section. He noted it could not be determined if it had been broom finished or what had been done there on the interior.

Mr. McConnel stated basically the joints would go back exactly as they are now. He noted the only dimensional difference is that the stairs would now be code compliant for 7 and 12. He stated 3 sets would not be touched.

Mr. Brown asked Mr. Strassler if there was any information on the original drawings for the train station regarding this.

Staff and Mr. Strassler met with Mr. McConnel on site to discuss the color, aggregate of stone, and finish. There are multiple areas of the existing concrete that show a broom finish was used in the past.

Mr. Michael Brown moved that the Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as discussed at tonight's meeting so that the walking surfaces will have troweled edges and tooled joints where there are controlled joints. The walking surfaces and interior can be a light broom finish.

Mr. Brown asked Mr. McConnel if this could be broom finished in two directions. Mr. McConnel stated he felt that would draw more attention to it. Mr. Brown clarified on how this could be done in order to blend this and try to minimize the eminent directionality of that by broom finishing it two ways. The edges will be troweled and the controlled joints will be tooled. The

non-walking surfaces will all be troweled and finished.

The motion was properly seconded and carried at 3-0.

OLD BUSINESS

There was no old business.

OTHER BUSINESS

Mr. Rhodes stated the 5G presentation for the Planning Commission was postponed and is now scheduled for June 20, 2019.

ADJOURNMENT

The Chair adjourned the meeting at 6:03 p.m.

Suzanne F. Simmons
Clerk of Council